

John Knowles Paine: Mass in D
New World 80262

John Knowles Paine: Mass in D
by Peter Eliot Stone

We Americans seem to set up more stringent and less rational criteria for our own music than for European music. We tend to speak of one European composer as being influenced by another but of his American counterpart as being derivative of a European model. Similarly, although not all European composers are comparable to Bach or Beethoven, we nevertheless enjoy them for what they have to offer; but we seem not to be willing to lend that same sympathetic ear to good American composers. The works of Amy Beach, George Whitefield Chadwick, Arthur Foote, Charles Tomlinson Griffes, John Knowles Paine, or Horatio Parker, for example (New World Records NW 247, NW 268, 80273-2, and 80280-2), rank with many contemporaneous European works in the repertory; but our prejudices prevent our listening to them openly, and ignorance of our traditions feeds those prejudices.

In *Music in The United States*, H. Wiley Hitchcock differentiates between a vernacular tradition (roughly, art that is based on native lore and idioms, is plebeian, naive, widespread, and appreciated for its entertainment or utilitarian value) and the cultivated tradition (art that is based on European materials, is genteel, sophisticated, somewhat limited to eastern centers, and appreciated for its moral, cultural, or artistic value).

As a result of a change in immigration patterns about 1880, German culture began to supplant English culture in the cultivated traditions of the eastern centers. Newly arrived German composers had their music played here by newly arrived German performers or by Americans trained by and conducted by Germans. German Romanticism thus replaced the English tradition in America, and the vogue for Mendelssohn and his contemporaries had taken over by midcentury. Soon, when a music student had money, he went to Germany to study. American music began to be published in Germany by Breitkopf & Hartel, and Arthur P. Schmitt, a music publisher who had emigrated to Boston, strove to print as many American works as his Leipzig branch could handle.

As musical activity increased, conservatories were started (Peabody was founded in Baltimore in 1860). In time, music departments would be established in universities, music teacher associations be formed, and concert halls be built. While New York became the performance center, Boston became the center of ideas, largely through the efforts of John Sullivan Dwight (1813-1893) and *Dwight's Journal of Music* (1852-81; see Robert Offergeld's notes for 80257-2, *The Wind Demon*), to which articles were regularly contributed by such writers as Alexander Wheelock Thayer (biographer of Beethoven) and Frederic Louis Ritter (the first historian of musical America).

Only toward the end of the century did the cultivated tradition and its newly established institutions turn away from Germany, open up to the American vernacular, and shift the European focus to French and Russian music. But at mid-century the German influence

was pervasive enough to dominate the musical education of a young composer from Portland, Maine—John Knowles Paine, born on January 9, 1839. (In 1924 another native of Maine, Walter Piston, whose Symphony No. 6 may be heard on NW 286, went to Europe on a John Knowles Paine Traveling Fellowship from Harvard University. Indicative of the change that had taken place was his destination, Paris, to study with 2 Nadia Boulanger. Copland, the first of many American composers to study with her in Paris, had arrived three years earlier.)

Paine's family descended from Sir Thomas Paine, born around 1400, who lived in Market Bosworth, England. Sir Thomas' namesake, Thomas Paine (161-1706), emigrated from England about 1612 and settled in Yarmouth on Cape Cod. Joseph Paine (1741-1827), the composer's great-grandfather, was born in Eastham on the Cape. In 1780 he moved to Standish, Maine, a few miles south of Lake Sebago. All his sons were born in Standish but eventually moved to Portland. Of these, John K. H. Paine (1787-1835) was the first to show musical ability. He was trained as a cooper in Standish, where he built a gristmill. During the War of 1812 a need for hand instruments arose, so Paine made fifes, flutes, bassoons, and drums and became a fife major himself. In 1820 he built the first church organ in the state, on which his grandson may have begun to build his own reputation many years later.

Grandfather Paine moved to Portland as an organ builder. He helped establish the town band and became its first director. Three of his sons—David, William, and Jacob—were successful music teachers. David was an outstanding organist, and William was a composer known throughout the state. Jacob took up his father's business, administered and directed the band, became a trustee of Portland's sacred-music society, was the franchised dealer for Chickering (which had been making pianos in Boston since 1823), and manufactured musical instruments and umbrellas (a common combination, perhaps because of the use of ivory in instrument keys and umbrella handles). John Huxford notes in his dissertation on John Knowles Paine that four major aspects of his career reflect the occupations of his father and two uncles: Paine is felt by some to be America's first great composer and organist and was the organizer and administrator of America's first college music department and the first professor of music in the United States.

Jacob Small Paine married Rebecca Beebe Downes in 1833; they had five children, of whom two, Helen and John, interest us here. Helen, five years older than John, was a contralto, pianist, and teacher. A member of the Rossini Club of Portland, she also sang with Portland's Haydn Association, which in 1873 was to give the premiere of her brother's oratorio, *St. Peter*, the first major oratorio composed in America. About 1850 John began his studies with Hermann Kotzschmar (1829-1909), conductor of the Haydn Association, who, like many other Germans, had fled during the 1848 revolution.

Arriving in Boston, Kotzschmar had met Cyrus L. Curtis, a Portland businessman, who convinced him to come to Portland to raise its musical standards. So well received was Kotzschmar that he made Portland his home. In 1850 a son of the Curtis family was named after Kotzschmar and later studied with him. Cyrus H. K. Curtis eventually

became a publisher (Curtis Publishing Company) and philanthropist. His daughter, Louise Curtis Bok, founded the famed Curtis Institute of Music in Philadelphia.

Young John Knowles Paine studied organ, piano, harmony, and composition with Kotschmar and by the age of sixteen had completed a string quartet. He gave his first organ recital in June, 1857, and on Christmas night of that year accompanied Portland's Haydn Association in Handel's *Messiah* under Kotschmar's direction.

In 1858 Paine left the United States to study at Berlin's Hochschule für Musik. Some of the money for his trip came from his own recitals (as Griffes was to finance his Berlin adventure forty-five years later-see notes for 80273-2), but most of his funds came from Helen, who gave the proceeds from her teaching to support her brother in Europe.

In Berlin, Paine studied organ with Karl August Haupt (1810-1891), a virtuoso and Bach enthusiast, and orchestration with Friedrich Wilhelm Wieprecht (1802-1872). By 1860, through recitals Paine gave during summer vacations, Germany and England knew of the brilliant organist and pianist from Portland.

When Paine returned to the States in 1861, his reputation had preceded him: Bach's own countrymen had acclaimed Paine's performances of Bach's organ works. (Later in his career, Paine would help found the American Guild of Organists.) In America, Paine insisted on performing Bach, much to the distaste of some of the critics. (For Paine's *Fantasie über "Ein' feste' Burg,"* Op. 13, probably written between 1858 and 1861, see 80280-2, *Fugues, Fantasias, & Variations.*)

Paine revisited Germany in 1866, this time with a completed mass. Why he chose to write a mass may be impossible to ascertain. In an era that liked to look back to the splendor of the Middle Ages, perhaps the language and shape of the mass were appropriately dramatic and grand yet suitably formalized for a "Classicist." A Protestant American of an earlier age had experienced the beauty of the Catholic service, although it clearly was not the splendor that appealed to him:

Went in the afternoon, to the Romish Chapel [in Philadelphia]. The scenery and the music are so calculated to take in mankind that I wonder the Reformation ever succeeded...the chanting is exquisitely soft and sweet.

So wrote John Adams in his diary on October 9, 1774.

Paine had begun his Mass in D in 1859 while in Germany but did not complete it until several years later. Huxford suggests that Paine wrote it with the hope of getting it performed in Berlin. Then, like now, a performance in Europe would help one's chances in America. Good reviews there would almost guarantee success here. The Mass received its premiere, apparently largely through the influence of Haupt, to whom it is dedicated, at Berlin's Singakademie on February 16, 1867, under Paine's direction. (Beer & Schirmer had published the piano/vocal score the previous year in New York.) It was the first large work by an American composer to be performed in Europe.

The audience included Crown Princess Victoria, mother of the eight-year-old Wilhelm II, who was Kaiser during World War I. A Berlin reviewer commented that Paine's "Crucifixus" "reached the highest ideals," an appreciation far from the standard European nonsense that America was only a country of steam engines, a remark that Louis Gottschalk reported was used to put him off when he tried to see the director of piano studies at the Paris Conservatoire.

Paine returned to Boston from Berlin probably in the spring of 1867. In Boston his friends Thomas Hill (president of Harvard from 1862 to 1868), the mathematician Benjamin Peirce, James Russell Lowell, Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, and the conductor Benjamin J. Lang (who was to make Boston's Apollo Club famous) arranged for the first Boston public performance of the Mass at the Music Hall in the spring of 1868.

John Fiske wrote in the *Atlantic Monthly*: "When [Paine's] Mass in D, a work of considerable power and great formal beauty, was published in 1866, command over musical form was at once evident." Information about subsequent performances is almost nonexistent. Gunther Schuller, composer, conductor, and from 1967 to 1977 president of the New England Conservatory, believes that Theodore Thomas may have played it in Cincinnati. The work may have been performed from time to time with just chorus and organ, or it may not have been heard until the New England Conservatory had its Festival of Americana in May, 1972, when the Mass was sung under Schuller's baton. According to Schuller's notes for the festival, as quoted in Richard Freed's notes for the St. Louis Symphony performances,

The orchestral parts which remained in Berlin were evidently destroyed in the World War II bombings of the *Gedachtniskirche*, also known as the *Kaiser Wilhelm Kirche*. A new set of parts had to be prepared especially for the present performance from Paine's own manuscript in the Houghton Library at Harvard.

Schuller continued:

The work is substantial—a full Catholic Mass sung in Latin, some eighteen sections, including a number of excellent fugues. Opinions vary as to the work's ultimate place in our musical culture and history, but one must certainly admire the work for its fine craftsmanship, particularly for someone so young in age—a fact which points up the thorough training composers received (in this case, in Germany) in the mid-nineteenth century. The work contains many moving and poignant passages, some of which will undoubtedly remind listeners of the Verdi *Requiem*—except for the fact that Verdi wrote his masterpiece some time after Paine's work was premiered in Berlin.

The Mass is scored for soprano, contralto, tenor, and bass soloists; mixed chorus; two each of flutes, oboes, clarinets, bassoons, horns, and trumpets; three trombones; timpani, strings, and organ. It clearly exhibits German influences: the syncopations, shifting accents, and scale figures followed by repeated chords in the Gloria indicate familiarity with Beethoven (also evident in Paine's First Symphony); the trumpet and the melodic outlines of the "Et resurrexit" remind one of Bach's Bminor Mass, and its subsequent repeated chords slashed out by the strings recall Handel. The absence of such influence in the work of someone in his twenties would be unusual indeed. But Paine already showed

his own stylistic preferences: rich and skillful orchestration; diverse textures, with a predilection for polyphony; clearly defined tonalities; regular metrical patterns; a large variety of cadences, with a tendency to avoid strongly articulative ones (so as to maintain continuity) except for important divisions; formal concision; and attention to detail.

In 1869 Paine married Mary Elizabeth Greeley. That same year Charles William Eliot became Harvard's president, and at his inauguration, as at Thomas Hill's, Paine's inauguration hymn, *Domine Salvum Fac*, Op. 8, was performed. In 1870 Paine was invited to give lectures for nothing, as he had once before. During the academic year 1870-71 he convinced President Eliot to announce courses for credit in music history and to organize a music department. In 1875, over the opposition of much of the faculty, he was made an assistant professor.

Complementing Paine's lectures at Harvard were his piano and organ recitals in which he made prefatory remarks about the composers and their works. These recitals and his lessons in harmony and counterpoint helped the faculty recognize music as a discipline as honorable as any of the more traditional ones. With his appointment as full professor in 1875, Paine became the holder of the first chair of music at an American university. Opposition continued. The historian Francis Parkman ended every meeting of the Corporation, Harvard's governing body, with the words "*musica delenda est*" ("music must be abolished"), a paraphrase of a sentence originally expressing Rome's hatred of Carthage.

Harvard was the first major American college to offer courses in music, but that redounds less to Harvard's credit than to Paine's and Dwight's. As we look at Dwight's conservative attitudes, it is difficult to suppress a smirk; but with due respect to Robert Offergeld, one should note that *Dwight's Journal* promoted what it called the modern Romantic movement—Schubert, Schumann, Chopin, and Mendelssohn—while it admittedly looked askance on Berlioz, Liszt, and Wagner (yet offered translations of fragments of their prose works). Was Dwight that far off course? The Berlioz revival is rather recent; Liszt is still looked down on by many musicians who are as professional as those who warmly greeted music Dwight didn't like.

Further perspective is needed, whether one does or does not agree with Dwight's tastes or his manner of expressing them. The Harvard Musical Association was in large part Dwight's creation. Although it was an amateur association, it provided chamber-music concerts and, later, symphony concerts in Boston; it helped build the Boston Music Hall and provided the groundwork for the establishment of the Boston Symphony. Surely Dwight's efforts deserve more than a smirk (and his taste may not have been so awry anyway; "charming" is a word that comes easily to the tongue when listening to some of the works in *The Wind Demon*; one searches for more profound words to describe the music of Paine). How then did the crossed paths of Dwight and Paine lead to significant milestones in America's musical history?

In 1808 Harvard students interested in music voted to form an organization for the purpose of mutual improvement, the Pierian Sodality (roughly, "the society of amateurs

inspired by the Muses”). So successful was that organization that in 1837 its graduate members formed the Harvard Musical Association, whose purpose was to exert leverage on those in power to better Boston's musical ambience. Dwight, who had graduated in 1832, became a leader of the group, which eventually, after incorporating in 1845, began promoting chamber concerts; the HMA founded the journal bearing Dwight's name. In that way not only did the Sodality gain influence at Harvard but so did the cause of music. In 1858 the Harvard Glee Club gave a concert in conjunction with the Sodality. Dwight's review praised the concert, wholly by students; pointed out how music was recognized now by the school's government, which had appointed an instructor in sacred music to train the Chapel Choir; but objected that “we do not learn what said instructor has to do with either [the Glee Club or Sodality].” Dwight continued by mentioning the pressures placed on the college by the community, the HMA, and the Sodality; by urging that music be recognized as one of the humanities and that a music professorship be founded; and by emphasizing the need for students to devote themselves to Bach, Mozart, Beethoven, and Mendelssohn.

When Paine had returned from his first German trip, he had begun to give a series of lectures on musical style and history. In 1862, during the presidency of Thomas Hill (grandfather of one of Paine's composition students, Edward Burlingame Hill), Paine was chosen to succeed Levi Parsons Homer, the sacred-music instructor of whom Dwight wrote. In March of that year, Paine volunteered to give free lectures at Harvard. Because the courses were not for credit, enrollment was low, and the courses were canceled.

By 1868 both the Boston Conservatory and New England Conservatory were founded; Harvard, freed from the problem of giving courses in applied music in a humanities curriculum, could now allow courses in history, theory, and the creative aspects of music. In 1871 a “select” men's chorus, the Apollo Club, was founded in Boston. In 1872, for the first time in its history, the Sodality had full wind and string sections. Thus the time had been ripe for Paine to get Harvard's Eliot to establish a music department, but only because Dwight and his satellites had helped prepare the way. At the commencement of 1869, Paine had received an honorary Master of Arts degree; the first earned M.A. went to Arthur Foote, a student of Paine's, in 1875 (see notes for NW 268). (In 1890 Yale awarded Paine an honorary Ph.D.)

As Hitchcock points out, Paine and the Second New England School, though called the Boston “Academics or 'Classicists,” were neither necessarily academicians nor pedantic nor were they classicists; rather, their position was somewhat analogous to Brahms's vis-a-vis the Lisztians and Wagnerians. When Paine accepted Boston University's newly created chair in Composition, Musical History, and Aesthetics (he also lectured at the New England Conservatory, where he served on the board of advisers), he reiterated his rejection of Lisztian and Wagnerian aesthetics and opted for “the adherence to the historical forms as developed by Bach, Handel, Mozart, and Beethoven.” The Second New England School looked to Schubert, Mendelssohn, and Schumann and had a predilection for the textures of Bach and Handel.

Such attitudes seem less obdurate in the light of comments Paine made in a letter of 1866 to Dwight about a reactionary friend; furthermore, Paine was to draw on Wagnerian ideas that would serve his own ends. Like some of the later “revolutionaries,” Paine feared not Wagner but the decay of Romanticism. It was, after all, an ex-Wagnerian, Friedrich Nietzsche, also fearful of that overripeness, who called Wagner “the last mushroom on the dunghill of Romanticism.”

Daniel Gregory Mason, another of Paine's students, wrote in 1895: “Thank God Wagner is dead and Brahms is alive. And here's to the great classical revival of the 20th century in America.” Mason was to write the following poem to the music theoretician and teacher Percy Goetschius:

One truth you taught us outlived all the rest:
Music bath Brahms to soothe the savage breast.

In light of the Brahmsian roots of the Second Viennese School and in light of the new classicisms of this century, Paine and his Second New England School, so closely allied with the Boston Brahmin Brahmsians, could almost be interpreted as progressive, not regressive, composers.

In 1873 Portland's Haydn Association and Boston's Handel and Haydn Society gave the premieres of Paine's oratorio *St. Peter*. In his April review of the event for the *Atlantic Monthly*, William F. Apthorp wrote: “Throughout the whole of Mr. Paine's *St. Peter*, the music is persistently of a religious character, never inclining to sentimentality.” He goes on to quote a dissenting review in the *Nation* of February 13: “One must be very much in love with Bach, and very little influenced by the modern taste for lyric forms, not to find a certain dryness in *St. Peter*.” Then, in August, John Fiske, also in the *Atlantic Monthly*, picked out the performance of *St. Peter* in Portland on June 3 as the great event of the season,

important not only as the first appearance of an American oratorio, but also as the first direct proof we have had of the existence of creative musical genius in this century. For Mr. Paine's Mass in D—a work which was brought out with great success several years ago in Berlin—has, for some reason or other, not particularly to the credit, one would think, of our best known choral associations, never been performed here. And, with the exception of Mr. Paine, we know of no other American hitherto who has shown either the genius or the culture requisite for writing music in the grand style...But while such works as Mr. [George E.] Whiting's Mass in C minor—admirably performed at Mount Pleasant, Boston Highlands, some two or three years ago—may bear a comparison with the best modern English music by [Michael] Costa or [William Sterndale] Bennett, a higher place must be claimed for Mr. Paine.

It would be foolish to speculate, he continues, to which rank posterity will assign *St. Peter*, and it would be unwise to bring it into direct comparison with *Messiah*, *Elijah*, and *St. Paul*, “but it must at least be said that Mr. Paine's oratorio has fairly earned for itself the right to be judged by the same high standard which we apply to these noble works of Mendelssohn and Handel.” He then notes that the one-hundred-twenty-five-voice

Portland chorus, though too small (!) for the powerful parts of the work, sang better than the four-to-six-hundred-voice Handel and Haydn Society chorus. The orchestra, however, played poorly: its parts were badly copied, and there were too few rehearsals, as the orchestra was based in Boston and the chorus was in Portland.

Theodore Thomas, who as a close friend of Paine's also commissioned the *Centennial Ode* for the Philadelphia Orchestra, conducted the premiere of the Symphony No. 1 in C minor, Op. 23, in Boston in 1876. Breitkopf & Hartel published the score in Leipzig in 1908, probably the first foreign company to publish a large American work. John Fiske's review called Paine a great composer who had the formal clarity of a Mendelssohn and the virile strength of a Schumann.

The Symphony No. 2 in A major, Op. 34 (*In Spring*), the first native symphony to be published in America, received a more unusual welcome: it was given its premiere in Cambridge on March 10, 1880, and another orchestra under a different conductor performed it in neighboring Boston on the following day. Discussing the performance of the work in Boston, Richard Aldrich, a Paine student, quotes in the *Dictionary of American Biography* a report that

ladies waved handkerchiefs, men shouted in approbation, and the highly respected John S. Dwight, arbiter in Boston of criticism, if not of manners, stood in his seat frantically opening and shutting his umbrella as an expression of uncontrollable enthusiasm.

Or was that Dwight's way of signaling his knowledge of Paine's musico-industrial roots?

The later works use more chromaticism, but they appear to lack the inspiration of the earlier ones. In his article on Paine for the forthcoming sixth edition of *Grove's Dictionary*, Kenneth C. Roberts, Jr., speculates that the inferior quality of the compositions of the last two decades of Paine's life was engendered by poor health, bitterness over his inability to get his opera *Azara* (1886-1900) mounted, and the boredom built into his long teaching career.

During Paine's lifetime his large works received many performances and much praise: the Mass, *St. Peter*, the incidental music for Aristophanes' *The Birds*, the cantatas (and many occasional choral pieces written for centennials of one sort or another), the two symphonies, the overture to *As You Like It*, and several symphonic poems are more numerous and notable than the songs and chamber and piano music.

Only the overture from his incidental music (Opus 35) for Sophocles' *Oedipus Tyrannus*, composed for a production by Harvard's Department of the Classics and first performed at Sanders Theatre in 1881, received many performances after Paine's death. (After the performances at Harvard, an 8 English-language version of the production was given in Boston and New York.) This overture represents that time in Paine's life when he finally moved away from the more conservative attitudes of his first twenty years and began to appropriate Wagnerian ideas.

Paine resigned his professorship in 1905 and died on April 25, 1906. In his many years of association with the Harvard community Paine cultivated the friendship of such giants as Ralph Waldo Emerson, Oliver Wendell Holmes, John Greenleaf Whittier, Henry and William James, William Dean Howells, Frederick Jackson Turner, Charles Eliot Norton, and George Santayana.

Composition students not mentioned above were John Alden Carpenter, Henry T. Finck, Frederick S. Converse, and Walter Spalding. His students of history and style included Archibald T. Davison, Olin Downes, M. A. De Wolfe Howe, Hugo Leichtentritt, Owen Wister, and Henry Lee Higginson. Paine advised Higginson and Isabella Stewart Gardner in the founding and early development of the Boston Symphony (see notes for NW 268). The socially prominent diva Emma Eames and Amy Fay (Lizst's pupil, pianist, lecturer, teacher, and author of the once influential and widely read—20th ed., 1912—*Music-Study in Germany*) were among Paine's musical friends.

Theodore Thomas' orchestra and the Boston Symphony often played Paine's music. In 1883 one listener sent George Henschel, the conductor of the Boston Symphony that year, the following Valentine greeting:

Oh, Henschel, cease thy higher flight!
And give the public something light;
Let no more Wagner themes thy bill enhance
And give the native workers just one chance.
Don't give the Dvorák symphony again;
If you would give us joy, oh give us Paine!

PRODUCER'S NOTE

by ANDREW RAEBURN

Getting to know the John Knowles Paine Mass and producing this record has been one of the most fascinating projects I've been associated with since New World Records started and indeed in all the years I've been recording. People have asked me what a record producer does, so I shall try to give you an idea both of the growing excitement with which I came to this piece and of some of the mechanics involved.

First, the artists and the place of recording are chosen. Powell Symphony Hall (a former motionpicture palace built in the 1920s) in St. Louis is acoustically one of the best concert halls in the United States. And it is a room in which an engineer can use the acoustics rather than have to fight them. One studies the score and discusses it with the conductor, in this case Gunther Schuller One discusses it also with the engineer. One member of his crew goes out to see what the facilities are like, what is needed in the way of microphones, whether the electric supply is in order, and so on.

I arrive in St. Louis on Monday of the week of the performances; we are to start recording on Friday. This gives me the opportunity to sit in on the soloists' rehearsals with piano, the chorus rehearsals, and all the rehearsals with the orchestra. I am able not only to get to know what the 9 performance will sound like but also to discuss potential

recording problems with Schuller. For instance, an empty hall has very different acoustics from a full one: as the bodies are not there to absorb the sound, the empty hall will be much more resonant. So in passages where the writing is fairly thick one will have to point up certain things, make certain accents more distinct for the recording than for the performance. There are also balance problems to be solved. And the producer becomes very familiar with all the artists, which is important because they have to work under considerable time pressure when you get to the actual recording, and they have to know that they can feel confident in your judgment when you tell them at some point that you've got a really good performance, and a really good tape of the performance, ready for the record.

Meanwhile the engineers arrive. Stan Tonkel, William Messina, and I have the opportunity to discuss any problems I foresaw in the recording and to decide how many microphones we are going to use and how we are going to place them. This avoids spending time asking for rebalancing within the orchestra and chorus, because whatever is necessary can be gently helped by the microphone setup. This recording used about twenty microphones, but the sound you hear is really a synthesis of eight, with small additions from the others. I hope we have retained the feeling of perspective so that you can hear that the soloists are in front of the orchestra, which is in front of the chorus.

In recording you have to consider what kind of acoustic situation the composer would have imagined for performance of his piece. We know that Paine began work on the Mass in Berlin; we also know a certain amount about nineteenth-century German and Austrian concert halls. I think it is a fair guess that Paine thought of this piece in a live concert hall with the kind of acoustics that in this country we are familiar with in Symphony Hall in Boston, which is similar to the Musikverein in Vienna and the old Gewandhaus in Leipzig (rectangular, not horseshoe-shaped, halls). Also, I am glad to say, many of those characteristics are shared by Powell Hall. We tried to give the recording a feeling of richness and depth and an overall glow; you should feel that you are in a spacious place and that this is a spacious and grand work, which it is.

So everything is made ready. We are set up in a control room, the large and elegant greenroom. The soloists, chorus, and orchestra on the stage are in telephonic communication with the conductor. There are two separate units now, and overall the pressure that indicates you have only so much time to record. And it is the producer's responsibility to somehow pace the recording so that everything is done within the time allotted.

Meanwhile, having listened to the rehearsals, I become more and more excited by this piece—its scale, its extraordinary intensity, its youthful freshness and daring, and above all its fascinating treatment of the text. There is not only a remarkable sensitivity to the text of the Roman Catholic liturgy but also a slightly eccentric (in the best sense) way of approaching it. The work's debts to Bach, Handel, Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Mendelssohn, and Berlioz are obvious, but Paine made a homogeneous, personal style out of his influences. There are remarkable moments when one is in the world of the Verdi and Fauré requiems, both written years later.

We hold four recording sessions for the Mass and record it out of order: one tries to plan the schedule so that nobody, especially the singers, becomes overtaxed. The basic plan of operation is to perform a movement through once; then there is a playback so that the conductor, the soloists, and members of the orchestra can hear their performance; then the performers go back onto the stage and make a second take, which in most cases is the basic master. If there are one or two slips, one covers them as small tape inserts. But there is not a great deal of editing necessary. In the record I think one strongly feels a sense of total shape, and for this one is very grateful to Gunther Schuller. He has incredible enthusiasm for this piece, which he discovered and revived a few years ago. I believe as he does that it will stand as a cornerstone of nineteenth-century American music.

The recording is now over, and we have ten reels of tape, out of which less than four come together as the final master. The producer now relistens to everything that has been recorded to make certain that what we all felt at the time of the recording was the best performance was indeed so; occasionally one gets carried away with one's enthusiasms for—or against—a particular moment, and although the judgments made at the time of a recording are in most cases correct, one likes to recheck. The score is then marked according to the takes the producer wants to use, and a cutting is done by a highly skilled editor. In theory one should be able to cut tape from one place to another without problems, but that is not always the case; therefore the editor is extremely important in the whole operation. Once the tape is edited, we record on eight tracks, which have to be reduced to two to make a stereo record. And Schuller, Tonkel, and I meet and make the final balance that is on the disc. This is again a crucial operation, and it is one in which the producer must be very selfdisciplined. There is an occasional temptation to over refine the performance, a rebalancing process that becomes quite fascinating but can be carried too far, can become a game, which it shouldn't.

* * *

The text of the Latin mass has for over six hundred years proved more powerful an inspiration than any other piece of literature to composers of many nationalities and religions. Consider the disparities among Taverner's *Western Wynde*; Byrd's three masterpieces; the settings of Victoria, Bach, Haydn, Beethoven, Liszt, Verdi, Berlioz, Dvorák, and, nearer our own time, Stravinsky, Vaughan Williams, and Martirano (80210-2); and, from a non-European background, the Central African *Missa Luba*.

To judge from Paine's Mass in D, his imagination and inspiration were seized with similar force. It is amazing that a composer in his early twenties was able so deeply and subtly and with such powerful music to capture and interpret the meaning of the text. It has been said that Paine wrote the Mass as a requiem on the tragedy of the Civil War, but the dates do not altogether work: he began the piece as early as 1859, although he did not finish until five years later.

The somber atmosphere that pervades the work is established at the very opening: the Kyrie is a true prayer; it lacks the confidence of settings like Haydn's, where one feels certain that the Almighty will answer the call.

The energy of the Gloria's 6/8 opening is wonderfully balanced by the restrained first utterance of the solo quartet ("Gratias agimus tibi..."). Violin and cello solos, with the organ, provide the spare accompaniment to the contralto's operatic prayer "Qui tollis." Tenors and basses, later the whole chorus, interject "miserere nobis"; the rhythm of the words is constantly echoed by the orchestra. The tenor-solo "Quoniam" begins and ends in a strong, confident G major; in a central recitative the mood for a short while becomes more gently questioning. "Cum sancto Spiritu" has a splendid, solemn introduction in the minor; the orchestral rhythm echoes the earlier miserere." The Gloria ends with an optimistic fugue.

Among the noteworthy features of the Credo is the mysterious setting of "et invisibilium." "Et ex Patre natum" is set in F minor, as if looking back from the point of view of the Passion rather than as an occasion of joy. This mood is repeated and intensified in the "Et incarnatus," where the 11 soprano solo seems to foretell the agony of the Cross and Mary's grief. The same idea carries forward to the "Crucifixus"; this is basically in C minor, but each time the music reaches "sepultus est" it goes into the major, as if to show that burial meant peace and rest (compare the final chorus of Bach's *St. John Passion*). There is an extreme concentration of energy in the unaccompanied chorus's final affirmation "Confiteor... in remissionem peccatorum..."

The Sanctus is unusual. It is for chorus and organ only and has a very nineteenth-century devotional quality. There is a blaze of sound in the "Pleni sunt." In terms of volume the end of the first "Osanna," a fugue, is the climax of the whole piece. In emotional terms the Benedictus is also climactic; the violin solo is taken up and expanded and developed by the vocal quartet, with solemn interjections from the chorus; the movement ends with a hushed choral "Osanna" against the violin solo, rising gently to a fortissimo only in the final measures.

The section in the Agnus Dei for soprano and contralto is dramatic and pleading; once more there is the feeling of effort to attain mercy and peace. The short and optimistic "dona nobis pacem," for soprano and organ, is reminiscent of the mood of the "Pie Jesu" from the Fauré Requiem. The Mass ends with the choral "Dona nobis"; doubt seems to have vanished; faith in the mercy of God is strongly, nobly affirmed.

COMMENTS BY THE CONDUCTOR by GUNTHER SCHULLER

How can one explain that an American composer in his early twenties and in a young, not even half-settled land, in a society with as yet only the merest cultural accoutrements (and those imported from Europe at that), could write a work so impressive, so precocious, so technically sophisticated, and so profoundly musical as this Mass? The traditional frame of reference and explanation simply don't apply: the young composer growing up in and absorbing a rich cultural tradition and being inspired or championed by a master teacher. On the face of it, it appears that Paine's Mass developed full-blown without benefit of the appropriate social-cultural environment that is usually the *sine qua non* for the emergence of a new creative star. How did Paine learn and absorb so much?

Where did he learn all that he put into this Mass? Where does the Italianate lyricism, particularly of the latter half of the work, come from? Why does a very young composer born into a predominantly Protestant society write a Catholic mass?

I don't suppose we will ever really know the answers to these questions, but asking them points out the uniqueness of this work, at least as seen in its special context. It is not as original as Beethoven's Ninth, or Berlioz' *Symphonie Fantastique*, or Wagner's *Ring des Nibelungen*, but it is relatively original considering the cultural wasteland out of which it arose. We have at best some partial answers. Of course, Paine studied in Germany and received the best instruction available there and studied his lessons well. Of course, he was musically gifted. Of course, he must have heard Beethoven's *Missa Solemnis* or Mendelssohn's *St. Paul* and *Elijah* or some of the other popular large-scale choral works performed at the time. But all of this cannot explain a work of such grandeur and haunting beauty as this Mass, by a composer so young.

The answer lies, as it must in all otherwise inexplicable manifestations of genius or great talent, in the creator himself and in the largely ineluctable mysteries of the creative process itself. Ultimately we may know *what* a composer did, but we may not always be allowed to learn *how* and *why* he did it.

There are many remarkable moments in this work, which I especially cherish and feel could only come from a major creative talent. Consider the opening Kyrie, in the key of D minor, a key so often reserved by the great masters (notably Mozart and Beethoven) for their weightier and most moving expressions.

Consider the magnificent and relative complex form of the Kyrie, with its three-paneled, triptych structure: A (exposition); B (fugato-development); C (contrasting subject in F major, the "Christe eleison"); A (recapitulation); B (fugato-denouement); Coda. It is in essence a fullblown sonata form movement. Then hear how wonderfully the Gloria, in all its D-major exuberance, complements the introspective, pleading Kyrie. Consider the poignantly beautiful "Qui tollis" with its unusual solo trio of contralto voice, violin, and cello, and the choral interjections of "miserere," rising several times to ominous climaxes. The G minor of the "Qui tollis" gives way to the radiant, gentle G major of the tenor aria "Quoniam." And notice how in the recitative "Tu solus Dominus," Paine uses the same material with which the cello led us back to the recapitulation in "Qui tollis," further linking these first two aria pieces. And how beautifully the coda of the tenor aria comes to rest in the final measures, in a manner reminiscent of the Verdi Requiem, which, however, I hasten to add, was written a dozen years after the Paine Mass. The first major section of the work ends, as might be expected of a composer of the time, with a solid, rousing Teutonic fugue, "In gloria Dei Patris."

The Credo is a truly positive song of affirmation. Notice the unusual five-bar phrases, certainly not common practice in the 1860s, which comprise the transition to "Et in unum Dominum," the middle section in 6/4. How lovely Paine's reverent treatment of the central idea of the liturgy—"Son of God, born of the Father"—in a *misteroso* F minor "Et ex Patre natum," before the full chorus and orchestra burst in on the bright, alliterative

words “Deum de Deo,” now in the related D-flat major. The music becomes ever more excited and feverish until Paine takes us quite suddenly back to the opening Credo, now on the words “genitum non factum.” This time a series of six-bar phrases (with lovely Brahmsian harmonies) help to calm the senses, until a single B flat in the solo horn leads directly into the soprano's “Et incarnatus est,” another fine example of Paine's Italianate lyricism. From the ethereal opening in high strings to the throbbing viola accompaniment and the indescribable, “deep” chords with which Paine sets the soprano's final “Et homo factus est”—only the oratorios of the great masters contain anything better.

A few simple string chords introduce the heart-rending “Crucifixus,” set in a dark C minor and in plaintive chromatic lines. One can literally feel the unbearable weight of the cross, the long-suffering march to Golgotha. With the words “passus et sepultus est,” the music becomes brighter, radiant, anticipating the glory of the Resurrection, only to return to the fugal “Crucifixus.” The final prayerlike phrase and its resolution to a most beautiful C major lead to the by now uncontrollable, joyous shouts heralding the Resurrection, “Et resurrexit.” This section brings to a close Part Two, a chain of pieces played without interruption since the Credo.

A marvelously virile bass aria, “Et in Spiritum sanctum,” quite operatic in its leaping melodic lines, fanfare figures, and rising violin arpeggios, sets the tone for the rest of the work. Notice also the hauntingly serene phrase in which the singer reminds us that all these happenings were foretold by the Prophets: “Qui locutus est per Prophetas.” The E major of the bass aria cedes to an E-minor “Confiteor,” sung a cappella and mostly *mezza voce*. It is hard to recall any early- or mid- 13 nineteenth century piece that in so brief a space of time alternates minor and major harmonies so naturally, at the same time moving ingeniously through a network of harmonic detours—D minor, E major, A minor, a sudden, momentary, radiant C major, then miraculously to F-sharp major, and back by the simplest means to E minor. The beauty of this movement is that Paine is able to make these harmonic adventures sound completely natural and touching.

Another long and well-wrought fugue in the best Teutonic tradition with a stormy, Beethovenian final presto leads us to the Sanctus, sung a cappella except for a modest organ accompaniment. This unusual, disarmingly simple setting is followed by a brilliant “Pleni sunt coeli” in B major and another grand fugue in D, “Osanna in excelsis.”

Far from exhausted creatively, Paine now crowns his previous achievements with the three finest pieces of the entire Mass: the Benedictus, Agnus Dei, and “Dona nobis pacem.” The Benedictus, with its ornate and poignant violin solo, sets the quiescent tone dominating the remainder of the work. Its transparent, almost fragmentary accompaniments resemble transfigured, distilled material, in texture almost like the late Mahler symphonies. Solo voices and vocal quartets alternate with choral responses set, incidentally, in alternating 7/8 and 6/8 measures, a startling and unheard-of idea at midcentury. The opening solo violin returns, now accompanied by the chorus's “Osanna,” rising to a magnificently handled, long-resolving plagal cadence.

With the Agnus Dei we are back in the world of drama, pain, and anguish, operatic in its syncopated, throbbing rhythms and dolorous outbursts in contralto and soprano. Three times the chorus's mighty, plaintive "miserere nobis" reminds us of the anguish suffered by the Lamb of God; the last time, with a subtle use of march rhythms, it leads us to the final "Dona nobis pacem." Here Paine's melodic gift is at its most supreme: radiant, soaring violin passages that seem to be floating above the music, stretching ecstatically toward heaven, are like a beautiful ornament to the undulating, restful D-major harmonies. For each measure, Paine—who seems unable to relinquish the flow of inspiration—finds new ideas, new harmonies, new melodies to glorify the final, peace-giving moments. One last agonized, longing phrase in the violas and bassoons brings ultimate resolution and peace, the quiet D-major answer to the D-minor question posed in the opening Kyrie.

KYRIE

<i>Kyrie eleison.</i>	Lord, have mercy upon us.
<i>Christe eleison.</i>	Christ, have mercy upon us.
<i>Kyrie eleison.</i>	Lord, have mercy upon us

GLORIA

Gloria in excelsis deo, et in terra pax hominibus bonae voluntatis. Laudamus te, benedicimus te, adoramus te, glorificamus te. Gratias agimus tibi propter magnam gloriam tuam. Domine Deus, Rex coelestis, Deus Pater omnipotens, Domine Fili unigenite Jesu Christe, Domine Deus, Agnus Dei, Filius Patris.

(Translation) Glory be to God on high, and on earth peace to men of good will. 14 We praise thee, we bless thee, we worship thee, we glorify thee. We give thanks to thee for thy great glory. O Lord God, heavenly King, God the Father Almighty, O Lord, the only begotten Son, Jesus Christ, Lord God, Lamb of God, Son of the Father.

QUI TOLLIS

Qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere nobis, suscipe deprecationem nostram, Qui sedes ad dexteram Patris, miserere nobis.

(Translation) Thou that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us, receive our prayer. Thou that sittest at the right hand of the Father, have mercy upon us.

QUONIAM

Quoniam tu solus sanctus, tu solus Dominus, tu solus altissimus Jesu Christe,

(Translation) For thou only art holy, thou only art the Lord, thou only art Jesus Christ, the most high,

CUM SANCTO SPIRITU

Cum sancto Spiritu in gloria Dei Patris, amen.

(Translation) With the Holy Ghost in the glory of God the Father, amen.

CREDO

Credo in unum Deum, Patrem omnipotentem, factorem coeli et terrae, visibilium omnium et invisibilium. Et in unum Dominum, Jesum Christum, Filium Dei unigenitum, et ex Patre natum ante omnia saecula, Deum de Deo, lumen de lumine, deum verum de Deo vero, genitum non factum, consubstantialem Patri, per quem omnia facta sunt, qui propter nos homines et propter nostram salutem descendit de coelis.

(Translation) I believe in one God, The Father Almighty, maker of heaven and earth, and of all things visible and invisible. And in one Lord, Jesus Christ, the only begotten son of God, begotten of His Father before all worlds, God of God, light of light, very God of very God, begotten, not made, being of one substance with the Father by whom all things were made, who for us men and for our salvation came down from heaven.

ET INCARNATUS

Et incarnatus est de Spiritu sancto ex Maria virgine, et homo factus est.

(Translation) And was incarnate by the Holy Ghost of the Virgin Mary, and was made man.

CRUCIFIXUS

Crucifixus etiam pro nobis sub Pontio Pilato, passus et sepultus est.

(Translation) And was crucified also for us under Pontius Pilate, suffered and was buried.

ET RESURREXIT

Et resurrexit tertia die secundum scripturas, et ascendit in coelum, sedet ad dexteram Patris, et iterum venturus est cum gloria judicare vivos et mortuos, cujus regni non erit finis.

(Translation) And the third day He rose again according to the Scriptures, and ascended into heaven, and sitteth on the right hand of the Father; and He shall come again with glory to judge both the quick and the dead; whose kingdom shall have no end.

ET IN SPIRITUM SANCTUM

Et in Spiritum sanctum dominum et vivificantem, qui ex Patre Filioque procedit, qui cum Patre et Filio simul adoratur et conglorificatur, qui locutus est per Prophetas, et unam sanctam catholicam et apostolicam ecclesiam.

(Translation) And (I believe) in the Holy Ghost, the Lord and Giver of Life, who proceedeth from the Father and the Son, who with the Father and the Son together is worshipped and glorified, who spake by the Prophets, and I believe in one holy Catholic and Apostolic Church.

CONFITEOR

Confiteor unum baptisma in remissionem peccatorum, et expecto resurrectionem mortuorum.

(Translation) I acknowledge one baptism for the remission of sins, and I look for the resurrection of the dead.

ET VITAM VENTURI

Et vitam venturi saeculi, amen.

(Translation) And the life of the world to come, amen.

SANCTUS

Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus, Dominus Deus Sabaoth,

(Translation) Holy, Holy, Holy, Lord God of Hosts,

PLENI SUNT

Pleni sunt coeli et terra gloria tua.

(Translation) Heaven and earth are full of Thy glory.

OSANNA

Osanna in excelsis.

(Translation) Osanna in the highest

BENEDICTUS

Benedictus qui venit in nomine Domini. Osanna in excelsis.

(Translation) Blessed is He who cometh in the name of the Lord. Osanna in the highest.

AGNUS DEI

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere nobis, dona nobis pacem.

(Translation) O Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us, grant us thy peace.

DONA NOBIS

Dona nobis pacem.

(Translation) Grant us thy peace.

The Saint Louis Symphony Orchestra was organized in 1880 and, after the New York Philharmonic (founded in 1842), is the oldest major orchestra in the United States. Its

conductors have included Rudolf Ganz, Vladimir Golschmann, Eduard Van Remoortel, Eleazar de Carvalho, Walter Susskind, and Jerzy Semkow. Between the 1930s and 1950s the Saint Louis Symphony Orchestra made many recordings for RCA Victor, Columbia, and Capital. Currently the orchestra records extensively for the Vox label.

Gunther Schuller, composer, instrumentalist, conductor, teacher, radio commentator, and writer, is past president of the New England Conservatory of Music, has taught at Yale University, was director of the Berkshire Music Center, and served with Seiji Ozawa as Artistic Co-Director of Tanglewood. In 1963 Schuller organized and until 1965 conducted the "Twentieth Century Innovations" concert series in New York. As a conductor he has made guest appearances with major orchestras in this country and abroad. As a composer he has received commissions from many major American orchestras. His Concerto for Orchestra was written for the seventy-fifth anniversary of the Chicago Symphony, and *Fanfare for St. Louis* was commissioned for the dedicatory concert at Powell Symphony Hall in 1968.

The Saint Louis Symphony Chorus was founded in 1976 and made its debut in Prokofiev's *Alexander Nevsky* under the baton of the orchestra's principal Guest Conductor, Leonard Slatkin, a performance subsequently recorded for the Vox label. Under the direction of the orchestra's Music Director and Principal Conductor, Jerzy Semkow, the chorus has participated in other Vox recordings.

Thomas Peck began his second year as director of the St. Louis Symphony Chorus during the 1977-78 season. He is also director of the Cincinnati May Festival Chorus and founder and director of the Grant Park Symphony Chorus in Chicago. Peck has guest-conducted at the Aspen Choral Institute and has prepared choruses for the Bach Aria Group and for the New York City Ballet to perform at Ravinia and at the reopening of Chicago's Great Auditorium. During Fritz Reiner's years with the Chicago Symphony, Peck was assistant to Margaret Hillis, who was director of the Chicago Symphony Chorus and Peck's principal conducting teacher.

Carmen Balthrop, soprano, was a winner of the Metropolitan Opera's 1975 auditions. She appeared at the Met as Pamina in Mozart's *Magic Flute* and subsequently toured with the company in that role. Before that she starred in the Houston Grand Opera's production of Scott Joplin's *Treemonisha*, appearing in Houston, at Washington's Kennedy Center, and on Broadway. She has performed in recital, with the symphony orchestras of Boston and Detroit, and with the opera companies of San Francisco and Baltimore. Her repertoire ranges from lieder to oratorio to contemporary opera.

Joy Blackett, contralto, won the National Opera Award in Washington, D.C., and has performed with the Milwaukee Symphony, the Seattle Symphony, the Musica Aeterna Orchestra in New York, the 17 Indianapolis Symphony, the Santa Fe Opera, and the Seattle Opera and at the Wolf Trap Festival. She has sung the American premieres of many twentieth-century works and has appeared in oratorio at the Aspen Festival and with the New York Choral Society and Musica Sacra in New York.

Vinson Cole, tenor, has sung with the major opera companies in this country and in oratorio throughout the United States and Europe. He has performed title roles with the opera companies of St. Louis, Santa Fe, Philadelphia, and Vancouver and has appeared with the Kansas City Philharmonic, the University of Missouri Orchestra, and Chicago's Northland Symphony. He made his debut with the Welsh National Opera as Belmonte in Mozart's *Abduction from the Seraglio*. Cole attended the University of Missouri. After winning a prize in Chicago's WGN Radio Auditions, he received a full scholarship to the Philadelphia Musical Academy and later attended the Curtis Institute of Music.

John Cheek, bass-baritone, received a Bachelor of Music degree at the North Carolina School of Arts and the Diploma of Merit at the Accademia Musicale Chigiana in Siena. He was a featured soloist with the United States Army Chorus and has subsequently sung with many of this country's leading orchestras and opera companies. He has made several appearances at the Wolf Trap Festival and sang in Verdi's *Macbeth* with the Miami Opera and in Bach's *St. John Passion* with the Minneapolis Orchestra. He has also performed with the symphony orchestras of Atlanta and Louisville and at the Tanglewood, Marlboro, and Spoleto festivals; and with the Boston Symphony and the New York Philharmonic.

SELECTED DISCOGRAPHY

- As You Like It*, Overture, Op. 28. (Concord Philharmonia [Philharmonia of Hamburg], Richard Korn conducting.) Concord 3007.
- . (Philharmonia [of Hamburg], Richard Korn conducting.) Allegro-Elite 3149.
- . (Royal Philharmonic, Karl Krueger conducting.) Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage MIA-141.
- Concert Variations on the Austrian Hymn*, Op. 3, No. 1. (Janice Beck, organ.) Musical Heritage Society ORA-263.
- . (Richard Ellsasser, organ.) Nonesuch H-71200.
- Fantasia uber "Ein' feste Burg,"* Op. 13. (Richard Morris, organ.) New World Records 80280-2.
- "Moorish Dance," from *Azara*. (Royal Philharmonic, Karl Krueger conducting.) Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage MIA-132.
- Oedipus Tyrannus*, Prelude from incidental music, Op. 35. (Eastman-Rochester Symphony, Howard Hanson conducting.) RCA Victor VM-608 (78 rpm).
- Prelude in B minor, Op. 19, No. 2. (Janice Beck, organ.) Musical Heritage Society ORA-263.
- Symphony No. 1 in C minor, Op. 23. (American Arts Orchestra, Karl Krueger conducting.) Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage MIA-103.
- Symphony No. 2 in A major (*In Spring*), Op. 34. (Royal Philharmonic, Karl Krueger conducting.) Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage MIA-120.
- The Tempest*, Symphonic Poem, Op. 31. (Royal Philharmonic, Karl Krueger conducting.) Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage MIA-130.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aldrich, Richard. "John Knowles Paine," *Dictionary of American Biography*, XIV. New York: Scribner's, 1937.

- Apthorp, William F. (Reviews of Paine's music,) *Atlantic Monthly*, XXXI (1873), 506; XXXVII (1876), 633; XXXVIII (1876), 124.
- Ayars, Christine Merrick. *Contributions to the Art of Music in America by the Music Industries at Boston, 1640 to 1936*. New York: H. W. Wilson, 1937.
- Bacon, Fred P., and Skelton, Edward O., eds. *Commemorative Record of the Handel and Haydn Society of Boston, 1815-1903*. Boston: Handel and Haydn Society, 1903.
- Barker, John W. "A Report on the Society for the Preservation of the American Musical Heritage," *American Record Guide* (1968), Vol.34, 766.
- Chase, Gilbert. *America's Music* (rev. 2nd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill, 1966.
- Edwards, George Thornton. *Music and Musicians of Maine*. Portland, Me.: Southworth Press, 1928.
- Ellinwood, Leonard. *The History of American Church Music*. New York: Morehouse-Gorham, 1953.
- Fiske, John. (Reviews of Paine's music,) *Atlantic Monthly*, XXXII (1873), 248; XXXVII (1876), 763.
- Hitchcock, H. Wiley. *Music in the United States: A Historical Introduction*. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, 1969.
- Huxford, John Calvitt. "John Knowles Paine: His Life and Works." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Florida State University, 1968.
- Roberts, Kenneth C., Jr. *John Knowles Paine* ("Bibliographies in American Music Series"). Detroit: Information Coordinators College Music Society, forthcoming.
- . "John Knowles Paine," *The New Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (6th ed.), Washington, D.C.: Grove's, 1979.
- . "John Knowles Paine," Unpublished Master's thesis, University of Michigan, 1962.
- Spalding, Walter Raymond. *Music at Harvard*. New York: Coward-McCann, 1935.
- Stevenson, Robert. *Protestant Church Music in America*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1966.
- Waters, Edward N. "John Sullin Dwight, First American Critic of Music," *Musical Quarterly*, XXI (1935), 69.
- Wiggin, Frances Turgeon. *Maine Composers and Their Music*. Rockland (?), Me.: Maine Federation of Music Clubs, 1959.

Gunther Schuller conducting the Saint Louis Symphony Orchestra
JERZY SEMKOW, Music Director and Principal Conductor

The Saint Louis Symphony Chorus / Thomas Peck, director

Carmen Balthrop, *soprano* • Joy Blackett, *contralto* • Vinson Cole, *tenor* • John Cheek, *bass*
 Joanna Lange, organ

DISC 1

1 KYRIE (*Maestoso*) 7:14 Chorus

2 GLORIA (*Allegro vivace*) 5:47

Quartet and chorus (Carmen Balthrop, soprano; Joy Blackett, contralto; Vinson Cole, tenor; John Cheek, bass)

3 OUI TOLLIS (Adagio) 8:07

Contralto and chorus (Joy Blackett, contralto; with John Korman, solo violin, and John Sant'Ambrogio, solo cello)

4 QUONIAM (Andantino) 7:37

Tenor solo (Vinson Cole, tenor)

5 CUM SANCTO SPIRITU 8:04 (Andante-Fuga: Allegro maestoso)

Chorus

6 CREDO (*Allegro*) 5:56

Chorus

7 ET INCARNATUS (Larghetto) 4:12

Soprano solo (Carmen Balthrop, soprano)

8 CRUCIFIXUS (Andante patetico) 7:31

Chorus

DISC 2

1 ET RESURREXIT (Vivace) 3:52

Chorus

2 ET IN SPIRITUM SANCTUM 3:52 (Andante maestoso)

Bass solo (John Cheek, bass)

3 CONFITEOR (Con moto) 2:57

Chorus, a capella

4 ET VITAM VENTURI 4:59 (Intermezzo-Fuga: Allegro molto)

Chorus

5 SANCTUS (Grave) 3:30

Chorus and organ (Joanna Lange, organ)

6 PLENI SUNT (Allegro pesante) 1:34

Chorus

7 OSANNA (Allegro molto e giocoso) 3:52

Chorus

8 BENEDICTUS (Adagio assai) 10:31

Quartet and chorus (Carmen Balthrop, soprano; Joy Blackett, contralto; Vinson Cole, tenor; John Cheek, bass; with John Korman, solo violin)

9 AGNUS DEI 5:44 (Andante con moto e appassionato)

Soprano, contralto, and chorus (Carmen Balthrop, soprano; Joy Blackett, contralto)

10 DONA NOBIS (Andante franquillo) 5:05

Chorus

These discs were made possible by grants from the Rocketeller Foundation, and the National Endowment for the Arts.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to John Tafoya, David Stone, and their colleagues in the library of the Saint Louis Symphony Orchestra. Joanna Lange played the Baldwin 640 Organ.

Producer: Andrew Raeburn

Recording and mixing engineer: Stan Tonkel

Assistant engineers: William Messina, Ted Brosnan

Tape editor: Don Van Gordon, Soundwave

Recording Studios Recorded in Powell Syphony Hall, St. Louis

Mastering; Robert C. Ludwig, Masterdisk

Cover art: Albert Bierstadt. "Sundet in the Yosemite Valley" (portion). Oil on canvas. pioneer Museum and Haggin Galleries, Stockton, California

Cover Design: Elaine Sherer Cox

FOR NEW WORLD RECORDS:

Herman E. Krawitz, President; Paul Marotta, Managing Director; Paul M. Tai, Director of Artists and Repertory; Lisa Kahlden, Director of Information Technology; Virginia Hayward, Administrative Associate; Mojisola Oké, Bookkeeper

RECORDED ANTHOLOGY OF AMERICAN MUSIC, INC., BOARD OF TRUSTEES:

Francis Goelet, Chairman; David Hamilton, Treasurer; Milton Babbitt; Emanuel Gerard; Adolph Green; Rita Hauser; Herman E. Krawitz; Arthur Moorhead; Elizabeth Ostrow; Don Roberts; Patrick Smith; Frank Stanton.

**NO PART OF THIS RECORDING MAY BE COPIED OR REPRODUCED
WITHOUT WRITTEN PERMISSION OF R.A.A.M., INC.**

NEW WORLD RECORDS
16 Penn Plaza #835
NEW YORK, NY 10001-1820
TEL 212.290-1680 FAX 212.290-1685
Website: www.newworldrecords.org
email: info@newworldrecords.org

LINER NOTES © Recorded Anthology of American Music, Inc.